



Materials for  
**LEGAL PROCESS**  
**FIRST YEAR 2004-2005**

**FALL 2004**

**VOLUME I**

**Professor Ayelet Shachar  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**Storage**

**KE** **The materials reproduced herein are solely for the educational use of students at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law only, and are not for commercial sale or use.**

**8345.5**

**.S43**

**2004**

**v.1**

**c.1**

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 9 1994

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Materials for  
**LEGAL PROCESS**  
**FIRST YEAR 2004-2005**

**FALL 2004**

**VOLUME I**

**Professor Ayelet Shachar  
Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto**

**The materials reproduced herein are solely for the educational use of students at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law only, and are not for commercial sale or use.**



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/materialsforlega01shac>

## LEGAL PROCESS

Fall 2004

Professor Ayelet Shachar

### 1. INTRODUCTION TO THE COMMON LAW SYSTEM

#### 1.1. Boundaries of Civil Litigation

Kenneth E. Scott, "Two Models of the Civil Process," Vol. 27 <i>Stanford Law Review</i> 937 (1975) (excerpt) .....	1
Mary Ann Glendon, "The Lone Rights Bearer" in <i>Rights Talk</i> (Free Press, 1991) .....	4
Adria Vasil, "Fast Food's Big Choke," Vol.22, No.43 NOW (2003) .....	5

#### Recommended:

Albie L. Sachs, "Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century: Real Dichotomies, False Antagonisms" in <i>Human Rights in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: Prospects, Institutions and Process</i> (Canadian Institute for the Administration of Justice, 1996) (excerpt).....	10
Lawrence B. Solum, "Procedural Justice," <i>University of San Diego Public Law Research Paper</i> (February 23, 2004) (excerpt) .....	15

#### 1.2. Precedent; *Stare Decisis*; Binding Authority; Persuasive Authority

Gerald L. Gall, "The Doctrines of Precedent and <i>Stare Decisis</i> " in <i>The Canadian Legal System</i> (Toronto: Carswell, 1995) .....	21
Ontario's Court System (chart) in Garry D. Watson et al., <i>The Civil Litigation Process: Cases and Materials</i> 5 <sup>th</sup> ed. (Toronto: Emond Montgomery, 1999) .....	25
Persuasive and Binding Authority in Comparative Context (chart) in Gerald L. Gall, <i>The Canadian legal system</i> (Toronto: Carswell, 1995). .....	26
Catherine A. MacKinnon, "Equality Under Law," in <i>Sex Equality</i> (Foundation Press, 2001) (excerpt) .....	29
<i>Halpern v. Canada (Attorney General)</i> , Court of Appeal for Ontario, June 10, 2003.....	33
Department of Justice, "Minister of Justice Announces Reference to the Supreme Court of Canada," July 17, 2003 .....	40

#### Recommended:

<i>Andrews v. Law Society of British Columbia</i> [1989] 1. S.C.R. 143. ....	42
Allan Hutchinson and Pam Marshall, "Making Moves, Legal Reasoning" in <i>The Law School Book</i> 2 <sup>nd</sup> ed. (Irwin Law, 2000) .....	48

Claire Hoy, "Doing it Democratically," <i>Law Times</i> , July 29, 2002 .....	62
"No Same Sex Marriage in N.B. until Law Passed," <i>The Chronicle-Herald</i> , July 24, 2003 .....	63
Eleanor Brown, "Why be Wedded to Gay Marriage?" <i>The Globe and Mail</i> , August 8, 2002 .....	64

### **1.3. Philosophies of Law and Government; Analytical Frameworks**

Purposive interpretation; positive law; legal realism; formalism; law and economics; anti-subordination approaches (critical legal studies, feminism, critical race theory)

Lon L. Fuller, "The Case of the Speluncean Explorers" (1999) 112 <i>Harvard Law Review</i> 1834 .....	65
"The Far Side," (Far Works Inc., 1981) .....	82

#### **Recommended:**

Paul N. Cox, "An Interpretation and (Partial) Defense of Legal Formalism" 36 <i>Indiana Law Review</i> 57 (2003) (excerpt) .....	83
Brian Leiter, "American Legal Realism," forthcoming in <i>The Blackwell Guide to Philosophy of Law and Legal Theory</i> (excerpt) .....	88
Nicholas Mercuro and Steven G. Medema, "The Jurisprudential Niche of Law and Economics" in <i>Economics and the Law</i> (Princeton University Press, 1997) (excerpt) .....	92
Patricia Williams, <i>The Alchemy of Race and Rights</i> (Harvard University Press, 1991) (excerpt) .....	102

## **2. THE LITIGATION PROCESS AND THE RULES OF CIVIL PROCEDURE**

### **2.1. Who Are the Parties to the Litigation? *Amici Curiae*; Standing; Intervention**

<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.13, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	104
<i>Borowski v. Canada (Minister of Justice)</i> (1983), 144 D.L.R. (3d) 657 (Sask. Q.B.) .....	107
<i>Canadian Council of Churches v. Canada</i> , [1992] 1 S.C.R. 236 .....	109
Cristin Schnitz, "Intervenors Set Record, Supreme Court 'Restrained' in 2000," <i>Law Times</i> , April 13, 2001 .....	113
Harvard University et. al, "Interest of Amici Curiae" in <i>Gratz v. Bollinger</i> and <i>Grutter v. Bollinger</i> (2002) .....	114

Charles R. Epp, "Do Bills of Rights Matter?" <i>90 American Political Science Review</i> 765 (1996) (excerpt) .....	121
---	-----

**Recommended:**

<i>Canadian Civil Liberties Association v. Canada (A.G.)</i> , [1998] O.J. No. 2856.....	126
Jacques Steinberg, "After 25 Years, a Road Map for Diversity on Campus," <i>The New York Times</i> , June 24, 2003 .....	147

**2.2. Where to Litigate? Jurisdiction and *Forum Non Conveniens***

<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.17, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	150
<i>Morguard Investment Ltd. V. De Savoye</i> [1990] 3 S.C.R. 1077.....	155
Bill Miller & Christine Haughney, "Old Law Creates Forum for War-Crimes Trials" <i>The Toronto Star</i> , August 13, 2000, B1 .....	157
"Human Rights and the Court," <i>New York Times</i> , July 3, 2004 .....	159
<i>Santa Clara Pueblo v. Martinez</i> , 436 U.S. 49 (1978).....	160
<i>Carnival Cruise Lines v. Shute</i> , 499 U.S. 585 (1991).....	167

**Recommended:**

Hague Conference, Preliminary Draft Convention on Jurisdiction and the Effects of Judgments in Civil and Commercial Matters, October 30, 1999 .....	177
---	-----

**2.3. When to Litigate? Limitation Periods**

<i>Consumers Glass v. Foundation Company of Canada</i> (1985), 51 O.R. (2d) 385 (Ont. C.A.) .....	182
Limitations Act, 2002, S.O. 2002, c. 24, Schedule B .....	185
Janet E. Mosher, "Challenging Statute of Limitation Periods: Civil Claims by Adult Survivors," Vol. 44 <i>University of Toronto Law Journal</i> 169 (1994) (excerpt) .....	203
<i>M.(K.) v. M.(H.)</i> , [1992] 3 S.C.R. 6 .....	208

**Recommended:**

Andrew T. Kenyon and Simon Mackenzie, "Recovering Stolen Art: Australian, English, and US Law on Limitation of Action," <i>Public Law and Legal Theory Working Paper No. 23</i> , University of Melbourne Faculty of Law (2002) .....	214
William K. Rashbaum, "New York Pursues Old Cases Based Just on DNA," <i>The New York Times</i> , August 5, 2003 .....	225

## **2.4. Multi-party Litigation; Joinder; Counter-Claims, Cross-Claims, Third-Party Claims**

<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.5, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	227
<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.27, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	230
<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.28, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	233
<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.29, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	237
Stephen Ellman, "Client-Centredness Multiplied" in <i>The Civil Litigation Process</i> , Watson et. al., 5 <sup>th</sup> Edition (Emond Montgomery, 1999).....	242

### **Recommended:**

<i>Pettey v. Avis Car. Inc.</i> (1993), 13 OR (3d) 725 (Gen. Div.) .....	248
<i>British Columbia Ferry Corp. v. T&amp;N.</i> (1995), 27 C.C.L.T. (2d) 287 .....	266

## **2.5. Class Proceedings**

<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.12, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	278
<i>Class Proceedings Act, 1992</i> , S.O. 1992, c. 6 .....	281
Kirk Makin, "Class-action Suits Explode into 'National Phenomenon'" <i>The Globe and Mail</i> , July 19, 2003 .....	305
"Legal Notice of Certificate and Approval of Class Action Settlement" in the Ontario Court of Justice (Court File No. 02-6556-CP).....	307
<i>Anderson v. Wilson</i> [1999] O.J. no. 2494 (C.A.).....	309
<i>Nantais v. Telectronics Proprietary (Canada) Ltd.</i> (1995) 25 O.R. (3d) 331 (Gen. Div), aff'd (Div. Ct.), at 347.....	314
<i>Hollick v. Toronto</i> [2001] 3 S.C.R. 158 .....	316
Deborah Glendinning & Meredith Gardiner, "International Class Action: Fact or Fiction?" <i>The Lawyers Weekly</i> , June 7, 2002 .....	322

### **Recommended:**

Garry D. Watson, "Class Actions: The Canadian Experience," 11 <i>Duke Journal of Comparative &amp; International Law</i> 209 (2001).....	224
Thomas Claridge, "Appeal Court Narrowly Rejects Proposed Mohawk Class Action," <i>The Lawyers Weekly</i> , July 18, 2003 .....	234
Michelle Taruffo, "Some Remarks on Group Litigation in Comparative Perspective," 11 <i>Duke Journal of Comparative &amp; International Law</i> 405 (2001) .....	235

## **2.6. Financing Litigation and Access to Justice**

Poonam Puri, “Financing of Litigation by Third-Party Investors: A Share of Justice?” 36 <i>Osgoode Hall Law Journal</i> 515 (1998).....	344
<i>McIntyre Estate v. Ontario (Attorney General)</i> (2001) 53 O.R. (3d) 137 .....	352
Justice Statute Law Amendment Act, 2002 .....	359
Ministry of the Attorney General, “Ontario Government Improves Access to Justice,” June 30, 2004.....	364
Solicitors Act. R.S.O. 1990, ch. 15, s. 28 .....	366
Ministry of the Attorney General, “Draft Regulation made under the Solicitors Act – Contingency Fee Agreements,” 2004 .....	370
The Law Society of Upper Canada, The Law Society Task Force on Paralegal Regulation “Regulating Paralegals: A Proposed Approach,” May 2004 .....	375
Private Insurance and Legal Software in <i>The Civil Litigation Process</i> , Watson et. al., 5 <sup>th</sup> Edition (Emond Montgomery, 1999) .....	386
Legal Aid Ontario, “About Legal Aid Ontario” (2003).....	391

### **Recommended:**

Lucie E. White, “Subordination, Rhetorical Survival Skills, and Sunday Shoes: Notes on the Hearing of Mrs. G.,” 38 Buffalo Law Review 1 (1990) (excerpt) .....	392
Julius Melnitzer, “The Business of Running a Class Action,” <i>Law Times</i> , July 14, 2003.....	404
Kirk Makin, “A Taste of Life in the Legal Aid Trenches,” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> , July 8, 2002 .....	406
John D. McCamus, “The Reshaping of Legal Aid,” in Canadian Bar Association, <i>Access, Affordable, and Appropriate Law Related Services in 2020</i> (2000) .....	407
Gillian K. Hadfield, “The Price of Law: How the Market for Lawyers Distorts the Justice System,” 98 <i>Michigan Law Review</i> 953 (2000) (excerpt) .....	420

## **2.7 Settlement and ADR**

Owen M. Fiss, “Against Settlement” (1984) 98 Yale Law Journal 1073 (excerpt) .....	440
Chris A. Carr and Michael R. Jencks, “The Privatization of Business and Commercial Dispute Resolution: A Misguided Policy Decision,” 88 <i>Kentucky Law Journal</i> 183 (2000) .....	443
Arbitration Act, 1991, S.O. 1991, ch. 17, ss.1-9, 17-20 .....	451
Judy Van Rhijn, “First Steps Taken for Islamic Arbitration Board,” <i>Law Times</i> , November 24, 2003.....	460

The Canadian Society of Muslims News Bulletin, Darul-Qada: Beginnings of Muslim Civil Justice System in Canada (April 2003) .....	461
Naima Said, "Representation of Muslim Clients in Divorce Proceedings," Workshop on Islamic Law, 2004 AALS Annual (Atlanta, Georgia, January 3, 2004) .....	464
Heather Mallick, "Boutique Law: It's the Latest Thing," <i>The Globe and Mail</i> , May 15, 2004 .....	467
Caroline Mallan, "Islamic law proposal to undergo review," <i>The Toronto Star</i> , Jun. 11, 2004 .....	468
Rules of Civil Procedure, R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.24.1, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	470
Superior Court of Justice, "Civil Case Management: Toronto Update," Summer 2003 .....	478
Michael P. Silver, <i>Mediation and Negotiation: Representing Your Clients</i> (Butterworths, 2001) (excerpt) .....	479
John Manwaring, "Mediation: Legal Issues," in Julie Macfarlane et. al., <i>Dispute Resolution: Readings and Case Studies</i> 2 <sup>nd</sup> ed. (Toronto: Emond Montgomery, 2003) .....	484

#### **Recommended:**

Jennifer J. Llewellyn, "Dealing with the Legacy of Native Residential School Abuse in Canada: Litigation, ADR, and Restorative Justice" 52 <i>University of Toronto Law Journal</i> 253 (2002) (excerpt) .....	485
<i>R v. Moses</i> (1992) 71 C.C.C. (3d) 347 (Y.T. Terr. Ct.) .....	493
Donna Coker, "Enhancing Autonomy for Battered Women: Lessons from Navajo Peacemaking," 47 <i>UCLA Law Review</i> 1 (1999) .....	502
Ann Kerr, "Mandatory Mediation Grows in Popularity," <i>The Globe and Mail</i> , June 17, 2002 .....	518
Daniel Girard, "Teen Bully Finds Justice, Healing and the Courage to Apologize," <i>The Toronto Star</i> , May 15, 2002 .....	419

#### **2.8. Discovery; Privilege and Confidentiality**

<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.30, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	520
<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.31, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	527
<i>Rules of Civil Procedure</i> , R.R.O. 1990, Reg. 194, r.34, amended to O. Reg. 263/04 .....	537

<i>Rainbow Industrial Caterers Limited v. CNR</i> (1986) 6 B.C.L.R. (2d) 268 (S.C.) .....	547
<i>Smith v. Jones</i> [1999] 1 S.C.R. 455 .....	548
<i>Ontario (Ministry of Environment) v. McCarthy Terault</i> (1992) 9 CELR (NS) 12 (Ont. Prov. Div.) .....	556
Gavin MacKenzie, "Is Keeping Secrets in Client's Best Interest?" <i>Law Times</i> , February 28, 2000 .....	559
Kristen McMahon, "In-house Opinion Protected by Privilege," <i>Law Times</i> , June 7, 2004.....	561

**Recommended:**

<i>Grossman v. Toronto General Hospital</i> (1983), 146 D.L.R. (3d) 280 (Ont. H.C.) .....	563
Jonathan Harr, "Discovery" in <i>A Civil Action</i> (Vintage Books, 1995) .....	566
Cynthia Day Wallace, "Extraterritorial' Discovery: Ongoing Challenges for Antitrust Litigation in an Environment of Global Investment," 5 <i>Journal of International Economic Law</i> 353 (2002) .....	591

### **3. THE LEGAL ACTORS**

#### **3.1. Judges: The Duty of Impartiality**

Bertha Wilson (Hon.), "Will Women Judges Really Make A Difference?" 28 <i>Osgoode Hall Law Journal</i> 507 (1990) .....	600
Jeffrey A. Segal and Harold J. Spaeth, "Models of Decision Making," in <i>The Supreme Court and the Attitudinal Model Revisited</i> (Cambridge, 2002) (excerpt) .....	609
Rosalie Abella (Hon.), "The Case for a Strong Court: The Judiciary is Accountable to the Public Interest, Not Public Opinion," in <i>Introduction to Legal Studies</i> (Captus, 2001) .....	614
"Welcome to the Court, but Fix the Entrance," <i>The Globe and Mail</i> , August 2002 .....	616
"Court Appointment Model for Supreme Court Appointments," University of Toronto Faculty of Law, <i>Judicial Appointment in a Free and Democratic Society Conference</i> , April 19, 2004.....	618
"In search of a New Model," University of Toronto Faculty of Law, <i>Judicial Appointment in a Free and Democratic Society Conference</i> , April 19, 2004 .....	620

**Recommended:**

<i>Lennox v. Arbor Memorial Services</i> (2001), 56 O.R. (3d) 795. ....	622
Richard F. Devlin, "We Can't Go On Together with Suspicious Minds: Judicial Bias and Racialized Perspective in R. v. R.D.S.," 18 <i>Dalhousie Law Journal</i> 408 (1995) .....	628

Peter H. Russell, "Toward a General Theory of Judicial Independence," in <i>Judicial Independence in the Age of Democracy</i> (University Press of Virginia, 2001) (excerpt) .....	636
--	-----

### **3.2. Lawyers: Professional Responsibility and Legal Ethics**

Charles Fried, "The Lawyer as Friend: The Moral Foundations of Lawyer-Client Relations" in <i>The Civil Litigation Process</i> , Watson et al., 5 <sup>th</sup> Edition (Emond Montgomery, 1999) .....	649
Duncan Kennedy, "The Responsibility of Lawyers for the Justice of Their Causes" in <i>The Civil Litigation Process</i> , Watson et. al., 5th Edition (Emond Montgomery, 1999) .....	655
Eric Anderssen, "Lawyers Swoop to Cash in on Native Claims," <i>The Globe and Mail</i> , July 10, 1999. ....	658
The Law Society of Upper Canada, "Rules of Professional Conduct: Executive Summary" (2000).....	660

#### **Recommended:**

"A fresh look at the Rules of Professional Conduct" <i>Ontario Lawyers Gazette</i> 4:3 (July-August 2000) 32. ....	664
--	-----

### **4. THE NEW FRONTIERS OF CIVIL PROCEDURE: BEYOND ADVERSARIAL LEGALISM; DOMESTIC, REGIONAL, AND INTERNATIONAL JUSTICE**

#### **4.1 Redefining Domestic Law: Challenging Traditional Jurisdictional Boundaries From Within the State**

John Burrows, <i>Recovering Canada: The Resurgence of Indigenous Law</i> (Toronto, 2002) (excerpt).....	672
Ayelet Shachar, <i>Multicultural Jurisdictions: Cultural Differences and Women's Rights</i> (Cambridge University Press, 2001) (excerpt) pp. 88-92, 146-150 .....	678
"Government to 'Bring Rights Home' on 2 October 2000," <i>The Lord Chancellor's Department</i> , December 7, 2000 .....	685
<i>Baker v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration)</i> , [1999] 2 S.C.R. 817.....	686
Simon Coldham, "Human rights in Botswana: Unity Dow v. Attorney-General," 36 <i>Journal of African Law</i> 91 (1992) .....	690

**Recommended:**

<i>Nisga'a Final Agreement</i> , signed on behalf of the Nisga'a Nation and Her Majesty in right of British Columbia on April 27, 1999 and on behalf of Her Majesty in right of Canada on May 4, 1999 and laid before the House of Commons on October 19, 1999, at paras. 39-40, 75-107. ....	692
“ECHR Incorporation into Domestic Law: The Human Rights Act 1998 and the Scottish Parliament Act 1998”, <i>The Scottish Parliament Information Centre</i> , January 15, 2001 .....	709

**4.2. Transnational and Supranational Legal Challenges in the Era of Globalization**

Anne Marie Slaughter, “The Real New World Order,” Vol. 76 <i>Foreign Affairs</i> 183 (1997).....	713
Julius Melnitzer, “Litigation Goes Continental,” Vol. 5 <i>L'Expert</i> 68 (November/December 2003) .....	721
Trevor C. W. Farrow, “Globalization, International Human Rights, and Civil Procedure” 41 <i>Alberta Law Review</i> 671 (2003) (excerpt) .....	727
Patrick Macklem and Ed Morgan, “Intervention at the Inter-American Court,” <i>Nexus</i> 68 (Spring 2002) .....	736
David Held, “Democracy and Globalization,” in <i>Re-imagining Political Community</i> (Polity Press, 1998) .....	738
<i>Presbyterian Church of Sudan v. Talisman</i> 2003 U.S. Dist. Lexis 4085 .....	747

**Recommended:**

American Law Institute, “Transnational Rules of Civil Procedure: Preliminary Draft No. 1: Commentary,” 33 <i>Texas International Law Journal</i> 513 (1998) .....	755
J. H. H. Weiler, “The Transformation of Europe,” <i>The Constitution of Europe</i> (Cambridge University Press, 1999) (excerpt) .....	770
James Crawford and Susan Marks, “The Global Democratic Deficit,” in <i>Re-imagining Political Community</i> (Polity Press, 1998) (excerpt) .....	773

**4.3. International Law: “Supreme” to the Supreme Court of Canada?**

<i>Lovelace v. Canada</i> , UN GOAR, 36th Sess., Supp. No. 40, UN Doc. A/36/40 (1981).....	783
International Court of Justice, “Basis of the Court’s Jurisdiction” (2004).....	786
“Not (quite) strangled at birth: The International Criminal Court” <i>The Economist</i> 364, July 6, 2002, 14 .....	790

Susan Esserman and Robert Howse, “The WTO on Trial,” <i>Foreign Affairs</i> , January/February 2003 .....	792
---	-----

**Recommended:**

Payam Akhavan, “Review Essay: The International Criminal Court in Context: Mediating the Global and Local in the Age of Accountability,” 97 <i>American Journal of International Law</i> (2003) .....	803
---	-----

**POSTSCRIPT**

Jessica Leeder, “A Breakfast Date at the Courthouse,” <i>The Toronto Star</i> , August 4, 2003, E3 .....	813
--	-----